### Green Chemistry Education Webinar Series

# Introduction to Green Engineering

July 29, 2014



# **Today's Speakers**

Matthew Eckelman Julie Schoenung

### Julie Zimmerman



Yale University Associate Professor of Chemical & Environmental Engineering, Forestry & Environmental Studies



Northeastern University Assistant Professor of Civil and Environmental Engineering



University of California Davis Professor and Vice Chair of Chemical Engineering and Materials Science



# Green Chemistry and Engineering: The How of Sustainability

Julie Beth Zimmerman, PhD School of Engineering and Applied Science School of Forestry and Environmental Studies Yale University

 Can we appropriately and successfully address sustainability challenges if our designs are not in themselves sustainable?

Purifying water with acutely lethal substances



# Precious, rare, toxic metals in photovoltaics



Agricultural crop efficiency from persistent pesticides





Energy saving compact fluorescent light bulbs reliant on toxic metals



# How did we get there?

- Ourgent and necessary challenges
- Noble goals
- Exciting science and technology
- Best of intentions



### energy



### climate

# toxics

and the second s



biodiversity

water

# New Approach

- Innovation based
- Solutions oriented
- Advancing competitiveness
- Intrinsic versus circumstantial
- Systematic sustainability

# Sustainability

"the design of human and industrial systems to ensure that mankind's use of natural resources and cycles do not lead to diminished quality of life due either to losses in future economic opportunities or to adverse impacts on social conditions, human health, and the environment"

J.R. Mihelcic, J.C. Crittenden, M.J. Small, D.R. Shonnard, D.R. Hokanson, Q. Zhang, H. Chen, S.A. Sorby, V.U. James, J.W. Sutherland, J.L. Schnoor, Env. Sci. Tech. 2003, 37, 5314-5324. The necessary transformational change of engineering design

# Impacts of Design Decisions

- For a typical product, 70% of the cost of development, manufacture and use is determined in its design phase.
- Analogous for environmental impacts



# Not just how you design but <u>what</u> you design

Schematic of potential benefits vs. investments



### Leap frog or disruptive innovation

# Sustainability

"Sustainability" without innovation is....unsustainable.

"Innovation" without sustainability is....unsustainable.

# Biomimicry



## Peacock



# How many chemical pigments are needed to produce this assortment of colors?

**None!** Color is produced through optical interference arising from the surface structure of the feathers

### Textiles...



### How many pigments used here?

# T<u>extiles...</u>

#### Textiles Enzymes



 Cellulase Enzymes
 Textile Processing Enzymes

#### Textiles Finishing Chemicals



Emulsifiers
Paraffins
Polyethylene Waxes

🛨 View All

#### Textiles Coating Chemicals



Butadiene Polymer
 Styrene Polymers

#### Textile Pigment



- Carotenoids
- Chrome Oxide Pigment
- Fluorescent Pigment
  - + View All

#### Textile Polymers



- Acrylic Polymers - Polyvinyl Alcohol

#### Textile Pretreatment Chemicals



Desizing Agents
 Detergents Agents
 Optical Brighteners Agents
 Tiew All

#### Textiles Dyeing Chemicals



Anti Creasing Agents
 Defoaming Agent
 Dispersing Agents
 (+) View All

#### Textile Dye Chemicals



- Denim Dye + View All

#### Textile Colorants

- Direct Dyes



- Disperse Dyes - Reactive Dyes + View All

### Finishing Chemicals

- Flame Retardants



The textiles sector uses thousands of chemicals many of them toxic

### **Abalone Shell**

Ē

Twice as hard as high-tech ceramics.
Behaves like metal under stress.

# How Industry Makes Ceramics

BEAT... clay to proper consistency.

BAKE... at high temperatures (2000 - 3000 <sup>o</sup>f).

for prolonged periods (15 – 50 Hours).

(Ceramics Industry Major Contributor To Global Warming)

### made by GE

### made by abalone

Abalone Ceramics Factory

**Glenn** Allen

## How do we make things?



### "Heat, beat, and treat"

### How nature makes things...

- \* Nature runs on sunlight \* Nature uses only the energy it needs \* Nature fits form to function \* Nature recycles everything \* Nature rewards cooperation \* Nature banks on diversity \* Nature demands local expertise \* Nature curbs excesses from within
- \* Nature taps the power of limits

- Janine Benyus, Biomimicry

# Systems thinking





Crutzen, P. J. The Anthropocene: The Current Human-Dominated Geological Era—Human Impacts on Climate and the Environment. In *Climate Change and Its Effect* 



Crutzen, P. J. The Anthropocene: The Current Human-Dominated Geological Era—Human Impacts on Climate and the Environment. In *Climate Change and Its Effect* 












# **Principles of Green Engineering**

- 1. Green Chemistry
- 2. Prevention rather than treatment.
- 3. Design for separation.
- 4. Maximize mass, energy, space, and time efficiency.
- 5. "Out-pulled" rather than "input-pushed".
- 6. View complexity as an investment.
- 7. Durability rather than immortality.
- 8. Need rather than excess.
- 9. Minimize material diversity.
- 10. Integrate local material and energy flows.
- 11. Design for commercial "afterlife".
- 12. Renewable and readily available.

Anastas and Zimmerman, Environmental Science and Technology, March 1, 2003

#### View complexity as an investment

 Case for modular, standardized, platformbased, upgradable design



### Integrate material and energy flows



# Durability rather than immortality





# Design for commercial "afterlife"



"When we reuse our products much less recycle them — we keep our costs down significantly," says Rob Fischmann, head of worldwide recycling at Lexmark. "The secondtime cost for these cartridges is essentially zero."





T65X 36K T65X 25K E362 9K C736 12K C79X 18K

Click here for a high-res download of this graphic

# Renewable and readily available





### Need rather than excess



#### After Eutrophication





#### Key concepts and relation to sustainable design

Fundamental concept: Technologies tend to evolve in similar ways towards "ideality", where all of the benefits of a product can be achieved while the product itself ceases to exist physically.



#### How we typically waterproof surfaces





# Lotus flower



#### Ideality, sustainability, & product design





Coffee decaffeination using CO<sub>2</sub> (not a "solvent" by FDA)

Coffee beans without caffeine

#### Ideality, sustainability, & product design

#### The task is the cleaning of clothes; current product is detergent.



Ideation and Sustainability

# The "ideal" solutions do represent leap-frog innovations



LADSTUDIO

Corporate structural problems with ideality

- Leap-frog may not fit within portfolio can a detergent company develop selfcleaning clothes?
- The will may be present, but the expertise may be lacking.

#### Leap-frog ideas can create structural problems



BUILD & BETTER LIFE BY STEALING OFFICE SUPPLIES Dogbert's Big Book of Business 101

A necessary caveat: How do we know our frog is jumping in the right direction?



#### Some frogs are poisonous ...



Sustainability is a process of continuous improvement, we can't forget to check to make sure we're actually improving.

# **Measurement Innovation**



Everything that can be counted does not necessarily count; everything that counts cannot necessarily be counted.

- Albert Einstein

### GC3 Webinar on Green Engineering

#### Matthew Eckelman, PhD

Assistant Professor Civil & Environmental Engineering Northeastern University m.eckelman@neu.edu

#### July 29, 2014

# Principles of Green Engineering

- 1. Green chemistry.
- 2. Prevention rather than treatment.
- 3. Design for separation.
- 4. Maximize mass, energy, space, and time efficiency.
- 5. "Out-pulled" rather than "input-pushed".
- 6. View complexity as an investment.
- 7. Durability rather than immortality.
- 8. Need rather than excess.
- 9. Minimize material diversity.
- 10. Integrate local material and energy flows.
- 11. Design for commercial "afterlife".
- 12. Renewable and readily available.

Anastas, PT and Zimmerman, JB (2003) Environ. Sci. Tech., 37(5) 94A-101A.

# Do Principles get us to the Destination?

**Design** principles

- Should produce superior products and projects
- Need to follow up with comprehensive assessment to ensure performance and guard against unintended effects



the road to somewhere, but where?

# Life Cycle Assessment (LCA)

Ē



Used with permission. Copyright Raul Carlson and Ann-Christin Pålsson, CPM, Chalmers University of Technology, 1998

#### Overview

Brief Description of LCA Methods

Case Studies

Life cycle mercury emissions from CFLs

Use of nanomaterials in electronics

Efforts to Integrate LCA and Green Chem/Engineering

# Life Cycle Assessment (LCA) in Brief

Ē

A systems modeling tool for characterizing, locating and quantifying the environmental impacts of a product or service



- Environmental impacts can occur at each life cycle stage and be non-intuitive
- Need to consider all stages in order to inform design or policy decisions
- Need to consider multiple environmental impacts, to ensure that we are not simply shifting burdens from one impact to another

# Life Cycle Management: Electric Cars









Source: U.S. Energy Information Administration, Annual Energy Review 2009 (August 2010).

"Its advanced powertrain will deliver significant energy efficiency advantages and zero CO2 emissions without compromising driving enjoyment."

- Ford, 1/8/11

## Life Cycle Assessment Steps

Industrial Activity



#### Assemble into a Life Cycle Inventory (LCI)

system-wide bill of resource use and emissions

#### Link to Life Cycle Impact Assessment (LCIA)

emission-fate-exposure-effect modeling of impacts

# Linking Environmental Impacts to Damages



### **Ex1** - Mercury Trade-Offs for CFLs

WAL\*MART Save money. Live better."

sense and simplicity

PHILIPS



CHANGE EVERYTHING

EQUIVALENCY:

Ē

It only takes 18 seconds to change a light. Save energy and cash now by switching to Energy Star CFL bulbs, available nearly everywhere light bulbs are sold.

The typical home has more than 40 sockets for light bulbs.



# The major sources of atmospheric mercury in the United States are:

Utility boilers32.8%MSW combustors18.7%Commercial/Ind boilers17.9%Medical waste incinerators10.1%Chlor-alkali4.5%

Total Emissions: 144 Mg/yr

• • •

**Fluorescent lamps** 



1.0%

#### Mercury Study Report to Congress

Volume II: An Inventory of Anthropogenic Mercury Emissions in the United States

## **Material Flow of Mercury**







Coal Hg content

Pollution control Volatilization fraction

Trans & dist losses Grid transfers Reduced demand from lighting efficiency

### **US** Results





Eckelman, et al. (2008). Environ. Sci. Technol. 42, 8564-8570

#### Ex2- Carbon Nanotube Life Cycle



- Adapt consensus USEtox impact assessment model for SWNTs to include colloidal processes
- Only consider freshwater ecotoxicity



## Differential CNT Toxicity

- Metallic or semiconducting depending on chirality and number – this also helps determine toxicity
- Large variation among CNT types in parameters that affect fate, transport, and toxicity



Purification and treatment Aspect ratio Residual metal content





**Functionalization** 

# **CNT** Releases



Worst Case Scenario 100% release; All CNTs stable in water column

**Realistic Scenario** Modeled concentrations based on fate and transport parameter estimates
## **CNT Ecotoxicity Production vs Releases**



Eckelman, et al. (2012). Environ. Sci. Technol. 46, 2902-2910



OCTOBER 28, 2012, 2:00 PM | 📮 34 Comments

#### I.B.M. Reports Nanotube Chip Breakthrough

By JOHN MARKOFF

FACEBOOK
TWITTER
GOOGLE+
E-MAIL
SHARE
PRINT

SAN FRANCISCO — <u>I.B.M.</u> scientists are reporting progress in a chip-making technology that is likely to ensure that the basic digital switch at the heart of modern microchips will continue to shrink for more than a decade.

The advance, first described in the journal Nature Nanotechnology on Sunday, is based on carbon nanotubes — exotic molecules that have long held out promise



I.B.M. Research

The face of an I.B.M. research scientist, Hongsik Park, is reflected in a wafer used to make microprocessors.

as an alternative to silicon from which to create the tiny logic gates now used by the billions to create microprocessors and memory chips.

The I.B.M. scientists at the T.J. Watson Research Center in Yorktown Heights, N.Y., have been able to pattern an array of carbon nanotubes on the surface of a silicon wafer and use them to build hybrid chips with more than 10,000 working transistors.

## Life Cycle of Nano-enabled Products

## Should a new GE principle be no nano?



#### CNT synthesis is insignificant: < 0.000000000001% of impacts

Dahlben, Eckelman, et al. (2013). Environ. Sci. Technol. 47, 8471-8478

## Integration of Green Chem/Eng + LCA



We're getting closer...

## **Green Chemistry Limitations**

 GC Principles guard against use of toxic inputs, but the field does not have a consensus quantitative method for evaluating upstream inherent risk

□ *iSustain* metrics for green chemistry principles

 $I = \frac{\sum_{i} (MatImpact_{i})(wt\% RawMat_{i})(100 - Rec\%_{i})}{\sum_{i} (wt\% RawMat_{i})(100 - Rec\%_{i})}$ scaled 1-100 on safety, health effects, environment, regulatory status

 Only considers 'first tier' inputs, doesn't consider multiple intermediate steps and complexities

## Green Chemistry and LCA

- Life cycle assessment and green chemistry: the yin and yang of industrial ecology
  - Anastas and Lankey
- Life-Cycle Approaches for Assessing Green Chemistry Technologies
  - Lankey and Anastas

□ LCA identifies hotspots and GC used to inform design...

## Life Cycle Assessment Limitations

## characterization factors have units of impact/kg emitted...

## zero emissions means zero impacts

## Ex: Polycarbonate via Phosgene Process

- Polycarbonate is contaminated with Cl
- Requires stoichiometric quantities of phosgene
- Phosgene is highly toxic and corrosive

## Alter Computational Structure of LCA

To calculate the LCI of a product system generating a given reference flow, we first calculate the **activity vector**, which represents all outputs of the product system, including all **intermediate flows** 

$$\vec{q} = \mathbf{A} \times \vec{\gamma} \Longrightarrow \vec{\gamma} = \mathbf{A}^{-1} \times \vec{q}$$

and multiply the vector of activity levels with the matrix of elementary flows

$$\vec{e} = \mathbf{B} \times \vec{\gamma}$$

Impacts are calculated with the inventory vector and characterization factors:

$$\begin{pmatrix} c_{11} & c_{12} & c_{13} & c_{14} \\ c_{21} & c_{22} & c_{23} & c_{24} \\ c_{31} & c_{32} & c_{33} & c_{34} \end{pmatrix} \begin{pmatrix} e_1 \\ e_2 \\ e_3 \\ e_4 \end{pmatrix} = \begin{pmatrix} i_1 = \sum_{m=1}^4 c_{1m} \cdot e_m \\ i_2 = \sum_{m=1}^4 c_{2m} \cdot e_m \\ i_3 = \sum_{m=1}^4 c_{3m} \cdot e_m \end{pmatrix}$$

## New LCA Metrics Using GC Concepts

Now calculate impacts based on use of all intermediate flows, rather than emissions

$$i^* = \sum_k c_k \cdot \gamma_k$$

## This represents **life cycle inherent hazard** or toxicity NOT based on projected emissions

## Conclusions

Life cycle modeling is a useful complement to Green
 Engineering design principles

- Indirect impacts or benefits may outweigh direct effects, so be careful for unintended trade-offs
- New tools and metrics are being introduced regularly to support Green Engineering practices

## GC3 Webinar on Green Engineering

#### Matthew Eckelman, PhD

Assistant Professor Civil & Environmental Engineering Northeastern University m.eckelman@neu.edu

## Thanks!

## GC3 Webinar on Green Engineering

Julie M. Schoenung, Ph.D. Professor and Vice Chair Department of Chemical Engineering & Materials Science University of California, Davis July 29, 2014

jmschoenung@ucdavis.edu

## Green Engineering Case Studies: Methods and Applications

- Economic Assessment
  - Materials Recovery Facility for Computer Displays (CRTs)
  - Cell Phone Disassembly
- Toxicity Potential and Chemical Hazard Assessment
  - Utility Meter Products
  - Thin Film Photovoltaics (CIGS)
- Hazardous Waste, Resource Depletion and Toxicity Potentials
  - Light Emitting Diodes (LEDs)
  - Artificial Lighting (LEDs, CFLs, Incandescent)



## Green Engineering Case Studies: Methods and Applications

- Economic Assessment
  - Materials Recovery Facility for Computer Displays (CRTs)
  - Cell Phone Disassembly
- Toxicity Potential and Chemical Hazard Assessment
  - Utility Meter Products
  - Thin Film Photovoltaics (CIGS)
- Hazardous Waste, Resource Depletion and Toxicity Potentials
  - Light Emitting Diodes (LEDs)
  - Artificial Lighting (LEDs, CFLs, Incandescent)





#### University of Galifornia, Davis

### Materials flow for end-of-life electronics





## Cathode Ray Tube (CRT) recycling

#### **Glass-to-Glass recycling**

- Closed loop recycling
- Conventional process
  - Separate case and metal part
  - Depressurize the tube, grind to cullet
  - Mixed output
- Saw cutting process
  - Cut with saw
  - Intact panel and funnel glass
  - Separate panel and funnel glass



CRTs after depressurized Exporting harm, 2002



Saw cut CRT : funnel, panel. Deer2,2003

#### Glass-to-Lead (Pb) recycling

- Open loop recycling
- Pb in the CRTs
- Crush and remove foreign materials
- Pb smelter



Kang and Schoenung, *Resources, Conservation & Recycling (2005) Volume 45. Issue 4. pp. 368-400* 



#### niversity of Galifornia, Davis

## Secondary copper (Cu) recycling

- Blast Furnace
  - Electronic scrap: 5 ~ 40 % Cu
  - Reduction; Fe +  $Cu_2O \rightarrow FeO + 2Cu$
  - Black Copper: 70 ~ 85%Cu
- Converter
  - Oxidation :  $4Cu + O_2 \longrightarrow 2Cu_2O$ - Blister Copper : ~95% Cu, oxide form.
- Anode Furnace - Reduce Cu (reductant: plastics, wood)
  - Cu cast into Anode : ~ 98.5% Cu
- Refining Electrolysis
  - Dissolved in H<sub>2</sub>SO<sub>4</sub> electrolyte
  - Pure Cu deposited on cathode : 99.99%
  - Precious metals recovered as anode slimes







## Precious metals recovery

- Silver, gold, platinum, palladium
- By-products of copper smelter
- Anode slime from copper electrolysis process.



Kang and Schoenung, Resources, Conservation & Recycling (2005) Volume 45. Issue 4. pp. 368-400



## Flow of cost and revenue in a MRF



Kang and Schoenung, Environmental Science & Technology, 2006, 40, 1672-1680



University of Galifornia, Davis

## Cost analysis (1)

Annual operating cost for an e-waste MRF.



CRT: 75 wt%, CPU: 25 wt%. Treatment amount: 2,500 ton/year.

Kang and Schoenung, Environmental Science & Technology, 2006, 40, 1672-1680



#### **Distribution of revenue by revenue source**



CRT: 75 wt%, CPU: 25 wt%, Total treatment: 2,500 ton/year.

Kang and Schoenung, Environmental Science & Technology, 2006, 40, 1672-1680

## Green Engineering Case Studies: Methods and Applications

- Economic Assessment
  - Materials Recovery Facility for Computer Displays (CRTs)
  - Cell Phone Disassembly
- Toxicity Potential and Chemical Hazard Assessment
  - Utility Meter Products
  - Thin Film Photovoltaics (CIGS)
- Hazardous Waste, Resource Depletion and Toxicity Potentials
  - Light Emitting Diodes (LEDs)
  - Artificial Lighting (LEDs, CFLs, Incandescent)



# Characteristics of the product system for a cell phone





# Hierarchical "bill of materials" based structure of a cellular phone

F



## **Disassembly revenue**



## Green Engineering Case Studies: Methods and Applications

- Economic Assessment
  - Materials Recovery Facility for Computer Displays (CRTs)
  - Cell Phone Disassembly
- Toxicity Potential and Chemical Hazard Assessment
  - Utility Meter Products
  - Thin Film Photovoltaics (CIGS)
- Hazardous Waste, Resource Depletion and Toxicity Potentials
  - Light Emitting Diodes (LEDs)
  - Artificial Lighting (LEDs, CFLs, Incandescent)



# Reducing toxicity potential in RIO Tronics electronic utility meter products

- (a) PulsePoint for domestic gas meters
- (b) RegistRead for dial indexes on both gas and electric meters
- (c) RotaRead for rotary gas meters
- (d) Remote Consumption
   Display (RCD) display
   unit connectable to
   other meter sensors



## Product bill-of-materials

- Bill of materials information provided by RIO Tronics
- Component compositions are quantified based on information provided by component manufacturers/suppliers and also estimated through dimensional specifications (e.g., printed wiring board components).
- Composition uncertainty is introduced due to reliability of data



Metal Polymer Ceramic Other

Lam, Lim, Ogunseitan, Shapiro, Saphores, Brock, Schoenung, IEAM, Volume 9, Number 2, pp. 319-328

## Fraunhofer IZM Toxic Potential Indicator (TPI)

Takes into account three main toxicity inputs based on European Union (EU) regulations:

- Occupational exposure limits based on maximum workplace concentration (MAK) or EU carcinogenic classification;
- 2) Water hazard classification (WGK); and
- 3) Risk phrases (R-phrases) Outputs a TPI score for materials from zero to 100. MAK NMAK N

1) Sum-weighted Component TPI method – weighs TPI scores by mass of materials in components

 $TPI_sum_k = \sum mass_{i,k} * TPI_{i,k}$ 

2) Max Component TPI method – assigns max TPI score to component based on highest impact material

 $TPI_max_k = max(TPI_{all_materials,k})$ 

where j represents material and k represents component.

## Summary Results for Both Component TPI Scoring Methods (e.g., PulsePoint)

PulsePoint Component Rank	Sum-weighted method (baseline)	Sum-weighted method (sensitivity analysis)	Max method (baseline)	Max method (sensitivity analysis)
1	Bracket	Bracket	Grommet	Grommet
2	Cable wire	Cable wire	Bracket	Bracket
3	Grommet	Magnets	Spring clip	Spring clip
4	Magnet base-B	Grommet	Printed wiring board	Printed wiring board
5	Spring clip	Magnet base-B	Resistor	Resistor

## Green Engineering Case Studies: Methods and Applications

- Economic Assessment
  - Materials Recovery Facility for Computer Displays (CRTs)
  - Cell Phone Disassembly
- Toxicity Potential and Chemical Hazard Assessment
  - Utility Meter Products
  - Thin Film Photovoltaics (CIGS)
- Hazardous Waste, Resource Depletion and Toxicity Potentials
  - Light Emitting Diodes (LEDs)
  - Artificial Lighting (LEDs, CFLs, Incandescent)



## **Overview of CIGS Technology**

#### CIGS is one of the most promising thin-film PV technologies CIGS = CuInGaS/Se



Ē



Thin Film

**Unique Applications** 

http://solarcellcentral.com/solar\_page.html http://solar.calfinder.com/blog/solar-research/cigs-solar-record-efficiency/

#### **Module Layer**

#### Layer Options



\*EVA: Ethylene Vinyl Acetate, EMA: Ethylene Methacrylic Acid \*SLS: Soda Lime Glass

Eisenberg, Yu, Lam, Ogunseitan, and Schoenung, Journal of Hazardous Materials 260 (2013) 534-542




#### CHA Tools: TPI and Green Screen for Safer Chemicals <sup>®</sup>

Priority Human Health Effects (PE)	Human Health Effects (HH)	Ecotoxicity (Eco)	Environmental Fate (EF)	Physical Hazards (Phy)
Carcinogenicity (C)	Acute Toxicity (AT)	Acute Aquatic Toxicity (AA)	Persistence (P)	Explosivity (E)
Mutagenicity (M)	Irritation and Corrosion (IC)	Chronic Aquatic Toxicity (CA)	Bioaccumulation (B)	Flammability (F)
Reproductive (R)	Skin/Eye Sensitization (S)			
Developmental (D)	Immune System effects (IS)			
Endocrine Disruption (ED)	Systemic Organ Toxicity (SOT)			
Neurological (N)				

Utilizes 17 hazard traits from United Nations Globally Harmonized System (GHS)

\*CHA: Chemical Hazard Assessment

#### CHA Tools: Green Screen

When all hazard traits are accounted for use iterative scheme to determine final hazard benchmark



before considered for next level

#### Substance Level CHA Example: Green Screen of CdS

	PE						HH			Ec	0	EF P		Pł	ıy		
CAS #/Material	С	Μ	R	D	ED	N	AT	IC	S	IS	SOT	AA	CA	Ρ	В	Ε	F
1306-23-6/ CdS																	

Use GHS and other national and international standardized hazard classification systems to determine relative hazard of each trait

#### Substance Level CHA Example: Green Screen of CdS

	PE						нн			Ec	0	EF		Pł	ıy		
CAS #/Material	С	Μ	R	D	ED	N	AT	IC	S	IS	SOT	AA	CA	Ρ	В	Ε	F
1306-23-6/ CdS	<b>1A</b>	3	2	ND	ND	1	4	2	2	ND	1	1	1			4	4

Use GHS and other national and international standardized hazard classification systems to determine relative hazard of each trait

\*ND: Not Detectable or No Data

#### Substance Level CHA Example: Green Screen of CdS



\*CHA: Comparative Hazard Assessment

#### Process Level CHA Example: CIGS Deposition

CIGS Deposit	tion Process	GS-Ba	ased Bench	nmark freq	uency	TF	Pl score	frequen	су	
Type of Processing	Specific Deposition Method	4	3	2	1	low	mid	high	very high	
Industrial Process	Coevaporation	0	1	4	0	1	1	2	1	
Ink Printing	Spray Pyrolysis of CulnS <sub>2</sub>	0	0	2	1	0	0	3	0	
Electrodeposition	Kapmann Method	1	1	4	2	2	0	5	1	
Industrial Process	Sulfurization/ Selenization	1	1	4	1	1	1	3	1	
Chemical Vapor Deposition	AP-MOCVD	0	0	6	1	3	0	2	1	
Electrodeposition	Kapmann Method with Ammonia	1	1	4	3	2	1	5	1	
	Hazard	Hazard Low> High Low> High								

#### Green Engineering Case Studies: Methods and Applications

- Economic Assessment
  - Materials Recovery Facility for Computer Displays (CRTs)
  - Cell Phone Disassembly
- Toxicity Potential and Chemical Hazard Assessment
  - Utility Meter Products
  - Thin Film Photovoltaics (CIGS)
- Hazardous Waste, Resource Depletion and Toxicity Potentials
  - Light Emitting Diodes (LEDs)
  - Artificial Lighting (LEDs, CFLs, Incandescent)



# 3. Materials and Methods3.1. Materials

#### $\bigcirc$ Small LEDs

Sample Name (color/intensity)	Red /Low	Red /High	Yellow /Low	Yellow /High	Green /Low	Green /High	Blue /Low	Blue /High	White
LED Color	Red	Red	Yellow	Yellow	Green	Green	Blue	Blue	White
Luminous Intensity (mcd)	150	6000	50	9750	50	5000	400	900	10000
Average Weight (g)	0.3098	0.2792	0.3130	0.2822	0.3114	0.2984	0.2982	0.3001	0.3068
Figure		Cit-I-I		35 mm	R			-	

### 3. Materials and Methods3.1. Materials

⊖ Bulbs



	Incandescent Bulb	CFL Bulb	LED Bulb
Wattage (W)	60	13	7.3
Luminous Intensity (lumens)	860	800	280
CRI (Color Rendering Index)	100	80	80
Color Temperature	3000*	2700	3000-3500
Lifetime (hours)	1000	10,000	50,000
Working Voltage (V)	120	120	85-265
Weight (g)	26	58	172

Lim, Kang, Ogunseitan and Schoenung, Environmental Science & Technology 2013, 47, 1040-1047

120

## 4. Results and Discussion4.1. Leachability Test: Small LEDs

OTCLP results for U.S. EPA hazardous waste regulation

	TOLD				LEC	(color/inten	sity)			
Substance	Threshold	Red /Low	Red /High	Yellow /Low	Yellow /High	Green /Low	Green /High	Blue /Low	Blue /High	White
Aluminum	N/A	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-
Antimony	N/A	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-
Arsenic	5.0	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-
Barium	100.0	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-
Cerium	N/A	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-
Chromium	5.0	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-
Copper	N/A	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-
Gadolinium	N/A	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-
Gallium	N/A	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-
Gold	N/A	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-
Indium	N/A	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-
Iron	N/A	332.5	178.3	206.0	163.5	211.8	161.8	178.5	130.8	202.3
Lead	5.0	186	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-
Mercury	0.2	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-
Nickel	N/A	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-
Phosphorus	N/A	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-
Silver	5.0	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-
Tungsten	N/A	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-
Yttrium	N/A	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-
Zinc	N/A	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	- 12

-"N/A" : Not Applicable, "-" : Not Detected

## 4. Results and Discussion4.1. Leachability Test: Small LEDs

#### ○ TTLC results for State of California hazardous waste regulation

					LED	) (color/intens	sity)			
Substance	TTLC Threshold	Red /Low	Red /High	Yellow /Low	Yellow /High	Green /Low	Green /High	Blue /Low	Blue /High	White
Aluminum	N/A	97.0	158.0	104.0	156.0	79.6	156.0	153.0	73.4	84.5
Antimony	500	15.4	2.0	2.8	1.9	3.6	2.5	1.3	1.5	25.9
Arsenic	500	11.8	111.0	8.0	84.6	7.8	15.2	5.7	5.4	-
Barium	10000	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-
Cerium	N/A	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-
Chromium	500(VI);2500(III)	138.0	28.6	32.7	27.9	84.1	49.3	50.9	30.3	65.9
Copper	2500	87.0	3818.0	956.0	2948.0	1697.0	3702.0	3892.0	2153.0	31.8
Gadolinium	N/A	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-
Gallium	N/A	135.6	95.0	63.8	79.1	75.6	3.1	2.1	1.5	3.8
Gold	N/A	39.8	45.8	30.5	30.1	40.2	176.3	32.5	118.6	115.9
Indium	N/A	3.4	1.7	-	-	2.5	-	-	-	-
Iron	N/A	285558.2	363890.8	300905.6	398630.4	310720.6	395652.2	339234.5	256499.3	311303.6
Lead	1000	8103.0	8.9	7.7	-	5.0	-	-	-	-
Mercury	20	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-
Nickel	2000	4797.0	2054.0	1541.0	2192.0	2442.0	2930.0	1564.0	1741.0	4083.0
Phosphorus	N/A	114.2	-	58.4	-	78.5	91.8	79.1	84.3	110.8
Silver	500	430.0	409.0	248.0	336.0	270.0	306.0	418.0	721.0	520.0
Tungsten	N/A	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-
Yttrium	N/A	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-
Zinc	5000	48.2	66.2	36.5	63.6	41.8	62.5	42.6	36.7	<sup>49</sup> 122

-"N/A" : Not Applicable, "-" : Not Detected

## 4. Results and Discussion4.1. Leachability Test: Bulbs

○ TCLP results for U.S. EPA hazardous waste regulation

	TCLP			LED	Bulb
Substance	Threshold	Incandescent Bulb	CFL Bulb	Ground to less than 2	Less than
Aluminum	N/A	13.3	39.8	59.8	8.9
Antimony	N/A	ND	ND	ND	ND
Arsenic	5	ND	ND	ND	ND
Barium	100	0.3	2.4	3.3	0.1
Cerium	N/A	47.9	7.6	19.6	0.003
Chromium	5	ND	ND	ND	ND
Copper	N/A	ND	4.3	3.1	0.027
Gadolinium	N/A	0.2	0.1	0.1	ND
Gallium	N/A	3.6	0.7	1.7	ND
Gold	N/A	ND	ND	ND	ND
Indium	N/A	ND	ND	ND	ND
Iron	N/A	59.1	967	1180	1.6
Lead	5	0.1	132	44.4	ND
Mercury	0.2	ND	ND	ND	ND
Nickel	N/A	14.1	7.3	17.0	0.2
Phosphorus	N/A	ND	ND	ND	ND
Silver	5	ND	ND	ND	ND
Tungsten	N/A	ND	ND	ND	ND
Yttrium	N/A	7.1	64.9	26.3	ND
Zinc	N/A	0.9	16.0	175	4.7

-"N/A" : Not Applicable, "-" : Not Detected

#### Lim, Kang, Ogunseitan and Schoenung, Environmental Science & Technology 2013, 47, 1040-1047

# 4. Results and Discussion4.1. Leachability Test: Bulbs

 $\bigcirc$  TTLC results for State of California hazardous waste regulation

Substance	TTLC Threshold	Incandescent Bulb	CFL Bulb	LED Bulb
Aluminum	N/A	40,100	31,700	947,000
Antimony	500	ND	117	123
Arsenic	500	ND	2.6	ND
Barium	10000	4.1	17.8	364
Cerium	N/A	9.4	9.6	7.8
Chromium	500 (VI); 2500 (III)	5.8	1.1	120
Copper	2500	942	111,000	31,600
Gadolinium	N/A	ND	0.6	0.1
Gallium	N/A	7.9	6.0	108
Gold	N/A	ND	ND	2.2
Indium	N/A	ND	ND	ND
Iron	N/A	372	12,800	12,300
Lead	1000	6.9	3860	16.7
Mercury	20	0.1	18.3	0.4
Nickel	2000	188	120	151
Phosphorus	N/A	ND	222	127
Silver	500	16.2	12.2	159
Tungsten	N/A	24.4	1.4	1.2
Yttrium	N/A	0.6	2540	1.7
Zinc	5000	320	34,500	4540

-"N/A" : Not Applicable, "ND" : Not Detected

### 4. Results and Discussion4.3. Toxicity Potential: Bulbs

Comparison of the incandescent, CFL, and LED bulbs taking into account design lifetimes (1000, 10,000, 50,000 hr, respectively).

Environmeı Cate	ntal Impact Assess gory and Method	sment	Incandescent Bulb	CFL Bulb	LED Bulb		
<b>Resource Depletion</b>	CM	L 2001	1	3	3		
Potential	EPS	S 2000	1	5	2		
	TL\	/-TWA	1	4	3		
Hazard-based Toxicity	PEL	TWA	1	13	3		
Potential	REI	TWA	1	8	2		
	-	TPI	1	16	2		
		Urban Air	1	22	2		
		Rural Air	1	$ \begin{array}{c ccccccccccccccccccccccccccccccccccc$			
	Human-Toxicity	Freshwater	1	25	FL BulbLED Bulb335243133821622222222522622232232322232323233		
	Potential	Sea Water	2				
Life Cycle Impost		Natural Soil	1	26	2		
Life Cycle Impact		Agricultural Soil	1	22	2		
(USEl0X <sup>····</sup> )-based		Urban Air	1	22	3		
TOXICITY FOTEIITIAI		Rural Air	1	22	3		
	Eco-toxicity	Freshwater	1	22	3		
	Potential	Sea Water	1	23	2		
		Natural Soil	1	22	3		
		Agricultural Soil	1	22	3		

- The CFL and LED bulbs have higher resource depletion and toxicity potentials.
- The CFL bulb exhibits higher toxicity potentials than the LED bulb.
- The lower potentials of LED bulb are mainly due to the longer life of LED bulb.

Lim, Kang, Ogunseitan and Schoenung, Environmental Science & Technology 2013, 47, 1040-1047

#### **Concluding Remarks**

- The environmental and human health impacts of engineered products can be reduced through the application of green engineering principles.
- Various methods can be implemented to guide greener design, including economic impact assessment; life cycle assessment; hazardous waste, resource depletion and toxicity potential; and chemical hazard assessment.
- Implementation of these methods early in the design phase maximizes the potential benefit to society while also maximizing engineering functionality.

# Thanks for joining us!

For more educational webinars or to learn about the GC3:

www.greenchemistryandcommerce.org

